A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW OF TRANSRACIAL ADOPTION LITERATURE

A THESIS

Presented to the University Honors Program

California State University, Long Beach

In Partial Fulfillment

of the Requirements for the

University Honors Program Certificate

Elaine Jennings

Spring 2019
I, THE UNDERSIGNED MEMBER OF THE COMMITTEE,
HAVE APPROVED THIS THESIS

A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW OF TRANSRACIAL ADOPTION LITERATURE

BY

Elaine Jennings

Yolanda Green, Ph.D. (Thesis Advisor)  Social Work

California State University, Long Beach
Spring 2019
ABSTRACT

This systematic review of ten transracial adoption studies, published 2000 or later and in the United States, was conducted to investigate the effects of communication relating to transracial adoptees’ cultural or ethnic identity, adjustment, racial awareness, and racial and cultural socialization. It was hypothesized that the way parents communicate with their transracially adopted children about racial issues will influence the formation of the adoptees’ cultural identity, adjustment, racial awareness, and socialization. Studies were found using online databases including PsychINFO and Academic Search Complete among others. Findings suggest racial, ethnic, and cultural socialization practices are an important aspect in transracial adoptions. In addition, communication plays an important role in racial and cultural socialization practices and the reviewed studies demonstrated the benefits of socialization practices for adoptees experiencing discrimination.

Keywords: transracial adoptions, race-related communication, cultural identity formation, racial and cultural socialization, racial awareness, child adjustment
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definition of Terms</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RESEARCH QUESTION</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LITERATURE REVIEW</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural and Racial Socialization</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Racial Identity, Ethnicity Identity, and Belonging</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHODS</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rationale for Systematic Review of Literature</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Search Strategy</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Limitations</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Table of Themes</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Table of Analysis</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

a. History

Transracial adoption is the placement of a child with a different racial or ethnic background than the adoptive parent. Social and political controversy about transracial adoptions in the United States came about since it began in the 1950s (Lee, 2003). Concerns about transracial adoptions causing psychological harm to the adoptees and transracial adoptive parents being culturally inadequate for adoptees contributed to the controversy (Bradley & Hawkins-Leon, 2002; Alexander & Curtis, 1996). Despite pushback there are annual increases of transracial adoptions in the United States, causing families to deal with many issues regarding race and ethnicity (Lee, 2003). The increase and need of transracial adoption derive from a lack of Caucasian babies for adoption and the disproportionality of African Americans in the foster care system (Child Welfare Information Gateway, 2016). Research about transracial families, or interracial families, were conducted in response to the debate about transracial adoptions (Lee, 2003).

b. Definition of Terms

In this systematic review two types of transracial adoptions will be examined; domestic and international. Domestic transracial adoptions are the process of interracial placement of children born within the United States (Bradley & Hawkins-Leon, 2002). Domestic transracial adoptions started with the Indian Adoption Act in 1958. In the 1960s, the creation of programs unifying African American orphans with families added to the population of domestic transracial adoptions (Lee, 2003). International transracial adoptions consists of interracial placement of children born outside of the United States. International transracial adoptions became more popular due to the pushback of domestic transracial adoptions in the 1960s and 1970s.
This systematic review looks at two types of communication; the adoptee’s perspective of communication of the adoption between the transracial parents and the transracial adoptee and the adoptee’s and the transracial parent’s perspective of communication about race, ethnicity, racial issues, and discrimination. Racial awareness is a “transracial adoptive parents' awareness of race in their own and others' lives” (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2015, PAGE 143).

Racial and cultural socialization practices are well researched processes of development in transracial adoptions. Racial socialization practices focus on the parent’s ability to help promote the adoptees’ racial awareness and skills to cope or resist racism, discrimination, prejudice, and bias (Lee et al., 2015). Cultural socialization practices are the parent’s incorporating an adoptee’s birth culture, like watching films, reading books, or attending ethnic festivals (Lee et al., 2015). Child adjustment is the ability of the adoptee to transition into a transracial adoptive family. Ethnic identity refers to the adoptee’s self-perception of belonging in a social group (Tajfel, 1981).

RESEARCH QUESTION

How does parental communication effect transracial adoptees’ child adjustment, ethnic identity, racial awareness, and racial and cultural socialization?
LITERATURE REVIEW

a. Cultural and Racial Socialization

In 2016, Lee, Crolley-Simic, and Vonk performed a study using Transracial Adoption Parenting Scale- Revised (TAPS-R), a cross sectional, online survey, to look at racial awareness, multicultural planning, integration, and coping skills (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). The study defines racial awareness as a parent’s recognition of their own and other’s races (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). This connects to the advantages and disadvantages race brings, which may affect their adopted child if they are a person of color (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). The study also tested for cultural and racial socialization practices. Cultural socialization practices refer to how adopted parents include the child’s birth culture into their families (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). Racial socialization practices develop the child’s racial awareness and produce skills to deal with problems they may face like racism, bias, prejudice, and discrimination (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). The study’s participants are from Families for Chinese Children, a parent support group throughout the U.S., with the requirements of parents’ adopting a child within the years 1994 to 2010 (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). The purpose of the study was to improve the TAPS test to account for parent’s socialization process. The study found racial awareness and cultural socialization had high intercorrelation (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). They also found racial awareness and cultural socialization likely connect with racial socialization (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016). The study hopes to collect more research about the effects of parenting regarding racial awareness and culture socialization effects adoptees of transracial and international adoptees. The study’s findings supports past research about parents usage of racial awareness and cultural socialization practices
with transracial and/or international adoptees and its effect on the adoptee’s own racial awareness and views of race and culture.

In “A path analysis of a cultural and racial socialization model in international transracial adoption: Racial awareness, self-efficacy, and socialization practices” the study focuses on finding related variables regarding transracial adoptions and cultural and racial socialization practices (Lee, Vonk, Han, & Jung, 2018). Participants included parents adopting children from other countries usually China, between 1994 and 2010, and having children between the ages 3 to 18 during the survey (Lee, Vonk, Han, & Jung, 2018). Study methodology included a path analysis which determines the immensity and significance of factors to determine cause and effect relationships. Some factors examined were parent’s cultural socialization self-efficacy, racial awareness, and post-adoption education and support (Lee, Vonk, Han, & Jung, 2018). Data was obtained through a convenience sample. Participants were given a link to an online survey. The study found the factors of racial awareness, socialization self-efficacy, and socialization practices to be directly or indirectly positively correlated to each other (Lee, Vonk, Han, & Jung, 2018). The study also suggested that parents who are more racially aware tend to be better at “communicating, educating, and assisting their children to cope with negative experiences due to racism, bias, and prejudices related to race” (Lee et al., 2015, 339). This study connects with my research question as it pertains to transracial adoptions and examine factors like racial awareness and how it affects racial and cultural socialization practices in regard to transracial adoptions, specifically for international transracial adoption. It also connects racial awareness to parents’ communication to their transracially adopted children about tough issues.

Another study, Racial Socialization in Transracial Adoptive Families: Does It Help Adolescents Deal With Discrimination Stress? online questionnaires obtained information
relating to adoptees’ experiences of discrimination, stress, and parents’ racial socialization practices (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, & Riley, 2013). This study used secondary data from “Adjustment of transracially and intraracially adopted young adults” by Feigelman (2000) about adjustment of transracially adopted youth. The data was narrowed down with the requirements of adoptive parents being white, adoptees being a racial or ethnic minority, between the ages of 13 and 18, and being in the adopted home in the United States by age 3 (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, & Riley, 2013). A hierarchical linear regression analysis was used to analyze the given data (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, & Riley, 2013). The results found an 85% variance of transracial adoptees experiencing stress related to discrimination (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, & Riley, 2013). The study supports the importance of transracial adoptive parents to engage their transracially adopted children in racial socialization practices to protect them from the negative effects of discrimination, specifically stress (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, & Riley, 2013). This demonstrates the importance of communication of racial issues because transracial adoptees have a significant amount of stress related to discrimination.

Pinderhughes and colleagues’ (2015) study supported parental influences were connected to cultural socialization, and both were connected to the adoptees’ self-label of ethnicity and feelings of self-labeling during middle childhood. Parental influences, or “parental role variables,” in the study were defined by “family ethnic identity and acknowledgment of cultural and racial differences” (Pinderhughes, Zhange, & Agerbak, 2015, para. 1). Participants included 46 families and were obtained from adoption related organizations and places promoting Chinese culture. Requirements for participants included Chinese adoptees with at least one White parent. Interviews were conducted with parents and children separately and data was analyzed using mixed methodology (Pinderhughes, Zhange, & Agerbak, 2015). Pinderhughes and colleagues’
found correlation between parent’s roles, cultural socialization, children’s ethnic self-label, and complex internal experiences (Pinderhughes, Zhange, & Agerbak, 2015). This study indicates parental influence have on adoptees’ cultural socialization and demonstrates both connected to adoptees’ self-perception.

b. Communication

Other studies reviewed examined communication patterns between adoptees and their parents. In “Family Structural Openness and Communication Openness as Predictors in the Adjustment of Adopted Children” the correlations between family structural openness, adoption communication openness, and child adjustment were tested (Brodzinsky, 2006). Family structural openness refers to how much information and contact the parents have with the birthparents. Adoption communication openness was defined as how the child views communication openness in the family, specifically about their adoption. Seventy-three children, ages 8 to 13, and their adopted parents participated in the study. The group included mainly domestic adoptions with more being same race adoptions and less being transracial adoptions. A fourth of the group were interracial adoptions, and within that group more were transracial than same race adoptions. Data was obtained through a larger study that used multiple self-reporting measures. Brodzinsky found a correlation between international transracial adoptees and less communication openness between parents and adoptees and lower self-esteem in adoptees (Brodzinsky, 2006). Communication openness had a notable positive correlation with the two child adjustment measures; higher self-esteem and lower adjustment difficulties (Brodzinsky, 2006). In this study, communication about adoption between parents and adoptees has positive correlations with child adjustment. This study does not include communication on racial issues
or discussion on race, but demonstrates the importance of communication openness between adoptee and parent as it effects the child adjustment.

*Identity Development in a Transracial Environment: Racial/Ethnic Minority Adoptees in Minnesota* examined four groups of transracial adoptions to see if transracially adoptees had higher risk for issues relating to self-esteem and ethnic identity development (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). The participants of the study included Asian, Latino, African American, and mixed/other transracial adoptees and same-race white adoptees. The study was a secondary data analysis from the Sibling Interaction and Behavior Study published in 2007; a longitudinal study from three large adoption agencies in Minnesota (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). The study’s purpose was to further research about transracial adoptees by focusing on communication about race and ethnicity. The study factors include adoptive identity development, adjustment outcome, and parent-child communication about race and ethnicity. Identity development focused on general identity, negative affect about adoption, and curiosity about birth parents (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). Negative affect about adoption was tested with Minnesota Center for Twin and Family Research-developed (MCTFR) Opinions and Attitudes questionnaire to measure antisocial behavior, prosocial behavior, aggression, and pro-family (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). Pro-family is defined by the adoptee’s participating in family activities and following their parent’s rules (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). In the parent-child communication factor, the mother, father, and child were surveyed separately. The study found a discrepancy between parent and child reports regarding communication about race and ethnicity with African American and mixed/other adoptees’ and their parents (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). Parents of the African American and mixed/other adoptees reported
higher levels of communication about race and ethnicity, while children reported lower levels of communication (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015).

In *Racial Socialization Practices of white mothers of International Transracial Adoptees*, Vonk and Crolley-Simic performed 8 in-depth interviews with white mothers with Chinese, Vietnamese, or Korean adoptees to examine their perceptions of racial and cultural socialization (Crolley-Simic & Vonk, 2008). The study categorized and analysis conversations between parent and adoptee as one of the actions mothers performed. The study determined subthemes and created four categories of cultural diversity exposure; *families like ours*, *visiting cultures*, *invested in culture*, and *diverse life* (Crolley-Simic & Vonk, 2008). The study found *families like ours* mothers discussed race when issues came up and *visiting cultures* mothers also discussed race when issues occurred, but focused on cultural pride (Crolley-Simic & Vonk, 2008). The study found *invested in culture* mother’s, adoptee’s birth culture was integrated more in the family and more conversation occurring about race and racial issues (Crolley-Simic & Vonk, 2008). The study found *diverse life* mother’s routine exposure and education about other cultures, races, activism for racial equality (Crolley-Simic & Vonk, 2008). This study provided more information about international transracial socialization practices and how it relates to the parents communication about race and culture.

c. Racial Identity, Ethnicity Identity & Belonging

Butler-Sweets (2011) qualitative study compared differences between experiences of adoptees based off of the races of adopted parents. The study’s population consisted of middle class black adoptees from age 18 to 30. Participants of the study mostly were obtained from New England colleges and universities in the United States (Butler-Sweet, 2011). There are three groups in the study, African American adoptees with two African American adoptive parents,
one African American and one white adoptive parent, and two white adoptive parents (Butler-Sweet, 2011). This study compared experiences of 32 in-depth interviews that are semi-structured for the three groups. Butler-Sweet found all adoptees grew up with their adoptive parent emphasizing the importance of how to properly articulate themselves. She also found black adoptees with two black parents connected this with disproving stereotypes of “blackness,” as they relayed the message “poverty does not and should not define blackness”(Butler-Sweet, 2011, pg 206). The other two groups of black adoptees, tended to believe in racial stereotypes of African Americans; blacks having poor grammar and are lazy, unlike black adoptees with two black parents(Butler-Sweet, 2011). Butler-Sweet suggested the group differences may result from access to middle class African American role models, while the other groups(one African American and one white adoptive parent, and two white adoptive parents) mostly saw role models in hip-hop(Butler-Sweet, 2011). Part of racial identity is how adoptees view racial culture.

In “Being Raised by White People”: Navigating Racial Difference Among Adopted Multiracial Adults, Samuels studied 25 transracially adoptees, specifically mixed African American and Caucasian adoptees (termed as black-white multiracial adoptees in study) from the United States recruited by advertisement, friends and family, and snowball referring(Samuels, 2009). Requirements besides being black-white multiracial adoptees were having adopted white parents and being at least 18 year old (Samuels, 2009). Samuels’ interpretive study evaluated the transracial families similarities and distinctions in their experiences to explore 3 aspects of the transracial adoptive family experience: “the centrality yet absence of racial resemblance, navigating discordant parent-child racial experiences and managing societal perceptions of transracial adoption” (2009). Interviews of the participants lasted about two hours and were
analyzed by computer. The absence of racial resemblance refers to the feeling of alienation from adoptees’ racial group from not being connected to their racial community (Samuels, 2009). Identity was also affected as adoptees felt distant due to the lack of physical resemblance with the family (Samuels, 2009). Majority of adoptees’ stated their parents used and supported colorblindness which lead to a lack of discussion of racism, race or ethnicity prior to the adoptee having a problem regarding them (Samuels, 2009).

Huh and Reid’s study (2000) was conducted to answer a multitude of questions regarding development of ethnic identities of transracial adoptees specifically of Southern Korean descent. The study participants consisted of Korean adoptees who were adopted less than 15 months old, and were 9 years or older during study, which occurred during March 1995 to February 1996 (Huh & Reid, 2000). All participants were from one North-eastern New York child welfare agency and if families had multiple Korean adoptees in the household, all were participants of the study (Huh & Reid, 2000). 40 Korean children adoptees, ages from 9 to 14, within 30 adoptive family households participated (Huh & Reid, 2000). All parents were Caucasian, mostly in their 40s, with some college or higher with professional or technical jobs (Huh & Reid, 2000). Children and parents were interviewed separately and were cross-check with each other. Interviews questions consisted of narrating certain events relating to developmental processes connecting with the children ages followed with probing questions (Huh & Reid, 2000). The article defines ethnic identity as relationship with both birth culture and the adopted parents’ culture and uses Cross’s development of ethnic identity to analysis (Huh & Reid, 2000). The study found ethnic identity to be positively correlated with participation in cultural activities and communication of adoption with parents and children (Huh & Reid, 2000). The study also found children at lower stages of ethnic identity development and had a harder time of adjustment had
adoptive parents that lacked involvement in birth culture and had poorer communication about
discrimination with adoptee (Huh & Reid, 2000). This study demonstrates the connections
between parent’s communication and involvement in adoptees birth culture on international
transracially adoptee’s ethnic culture development.

METHODS

Rationale for Systematic Review of Literature

Obtaining first hand data from an agency that works with transracial adoptions is difficult
as many agencies would not give the information due to confidentiality. Finding and
interviewing a small group of transracial adoptees is another less effective method because it will
limit the study’s generalizability. As a result, analyzing the current literature on the
communication between adopted parents and their transracial adopted parents and their
transracial children is most effective.

Search Strategy

Online databases were used to search including: PsychINFO, PubMed@CSULB,
Academic Search Complete, Sociological Abstracts, and Google Scholar. In the electronic online
databases keywords that were searched included transracial adoptions and communication,
transracial adoption and discussions and parent, transracial adoption and identity, transracial
adoption and racial identity and communication, transracial adoption and racial and
communication, and transracial adoption and child awareness or racial identity or racial
awareness or racial socialization or cultural socialization or ethnicity socialization. A secondary
search of reference list of articles was conducted as well. Additionally, more information and
articles were obtained by contacting Holt International, an adoption agency, and emailing,
Caitlin Howe, Adoptee Programs Coordinator, who provided additional studies about racial
identity development for transracial adoptees. Broadening criteria was needed to obtain enough
studies for the systematic review by increasing the timeline from within the last 10 years to any
study from 2000 or later and studies including international transracial adoptees studies if they
were mainly raised in the United States was required to collect enough studies.

Inclusion criteria was: (a) studies conducted in 2000 or later; (b) studies were conducted
in the United States; (c) studies were about transracial adoptions (international transracial
adoption included); (d) studies examined communication, racial socialization, cultural
socialization, child adjustment, racial identity, and/or racial awareness; and (e) studies must have
been published or in a peer-reviewed journal.

After collecting the articles, the research question used to identify findings related to the
independent and dependent variables. Research findings were extracted from each study and
inputted in a chart to be easily compared (see table 2). Throughout the process, the findings were
discussed with an academic advisor to minimize errors.

Research Limitations

It is important to keep in mind the limited current research done on transracial adoptions,
and there are even fewer studies on how communication affects adoptees’ identity formation.
Another limitation is ensuring to keep the time frame of reviewed studies recent, so it is still
relevant and not outdated. Collecting older data may have different communication tactics and different racial discussion. Location of the reviewed studies is another factor to keep in mind as it may affect the topic of racial discussion and forms of communication. Keeping studies within the U.S. is ideal to better evaluate racial discussion within the context of the U.S. Ethnicity is important in evaluating research because that can create differences between different ethnicities of parents and adoptees. Lastly, all the studies had differences in defining and measuring variables. Overall, this methodology may not be able to answer the research question completely and may only hint at the answer.

ANALYSIS & DISCUSSION

The aim of this systematic review was to determine what effect parental communication has on transracial adoptees regarding adjustment, identity, racial awareness, and racial and cultural socialization. The majority of studies reviewed were qualitative interviewing parents and adoptees. Other studies used mixed methods or focused on quantitative data solely. Few studies focused on either the child-reporting (adoptee) or parent-reporting. Interpretive studies and analysis of interviews were done with the qualitative data to better compare families and their experiences and extract specific information researchers were testing for. Qualitative data seems more appropriate for transracial adoption studies as participants may be hard to find, the specific information is harder to retrieve from qualitative data, and questions could be misconstrued in quantitative data.
Eight of the ten studies adoptees partly used or focused solely on transracial adoptees with Asian decent and were also international adoptions. This review includes a lot of international transracial adoption due to having to extend data searching parameters to include international transracial adoptions to obtain enough studies.

Six studies focusing on racial and cultural socialization were found. Crolley-Simic and Vonk’s study (2008) found the amount of parental communication regarding race, ethnicity, and discrimination increases with increased levels of socialization practices. One study, *Intercountry Transracial Adoption & Ethnic Identity: Korean Example*, focused on cultural socialization practices definitions in a study about ethnic identity and child adjustment, but did not state the terminology “socialization practices” (Huh & Reid, 2000). Huh and Reid (2000) found lack of parent involvement in birth culture, which is part of cultural socialization practices, was correlated to poorer communication about discrimination with transracial parents and transracial adoptees. Another study found parents have a role in cultural socialization practices and the parent’s awareness acknowledgement, which can influence communication, allows support for adoptees by helping them to cope and create their own self-label (Pinderhughes, Zhange, & Agerbak, 2015). Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, and Iacono’s article (2015) and Lee, Vonk, Han, and Jung’s article (2018) found socialization practices to be related to communication and had benefits for adoptees to deal or cope with racism and discrimination. Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, and Riley (2013) found racial socialization practices included communication and help with the stress that comes with discrimination adoptees face. All definitions of racial and cultural socialization included communication of transracial parents in some aspect, demonstrating high importance of communication in racial and cultural socialization. Communication tended to be mentioned in racial and cultural socialization regarding parents.
communicating to transracial adoptees about race, ethnicity, culture, discrimination, and racial issues. However, it should be noted that communication was not fully examined in the majority of articles reviewed on socialization practices.

Two studies focusing on child adjustment were found. One study found no effect on child adjustment for transracial adoptees compared to same-race adoptees, but found a discrepancy between communication about race between parents and adoptees in reports (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). In Huh & Reid’s (2000) study ethnic identity affected child adjustment, not communication. Studies on child adjustment and communication had inconclusive results in determining an answer about communication and child adjustment.

Five studies focusing on ethnic or racial identity were found. In Huh and Reid’s study (2000), communication about adoption and participation in cultural activities with the adoptive child were positively correlated with ethnic identity, and ethnic identity was found to affect child adjustment. It also found parent’s lack of involvement in birth culture of adoptee was connected to less communication with parents and adoptees regarding discrimination (Huh & Reid, 2000). In Samuel’s study (2009), 23 out of the 25 adoptee participants stated their adoptive parents used colorblindness, creating minimal communication about race, and they had issues with identity due to not looking biologically similar to their adoptive parents. Without communication, racial and biological differences create a “loss of self and racial kinship” (Samuel, 2009, pg. 88). In Crolley-Simic and Vonk’s study (2008), the findings highlighted the importance of racial and cultural socialization with racial identity development, making communication indirectly connected with racial identity development. In contrast, Butler-Sweet (2011) examined the “crisis of authenticity” relating to the identity of Black middle-class adoptees (Butler-Sweet, 2011, 205). The study found monoracial parents had communication with the African American
adoptees about disproving stereotypes of blacks, but also created a struggle of identity for middle class African American, while biracial parents of white parents had a lack of communication, and more stereotypical perceptions of African Americans, but adoptees with biracial parents or white parents had less issues with identity (Butler-Sweet, 2011). One study found no difference between transracial adoptees and same-race adoptees in regards to identity and child adjustment. However, the study found a discrepancy about communication about race and ethnicity between parents reporting high communication(Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). No clear connection between communication from parents to adoptees, but majority of studies demonstrated communication to be a factor in ethnic identity development. Communication seemed have both positive, negative, and no results with adoptees’ identity.

Only two articles, using the same data set, focused on racial awareness. One article found more communication of parents about race helped adoptees to fight perceptions of stereotypes which better equipped adoptees to deal with racial discrimination (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015). The Lee, Vonk, Han, & Jung (2018) article found racial awareness to be correlated with socialization self-efficacy and socialization practices and benefited parents for communicating with adoptees on tougher issues. Racial awareness of parent seems to have benefits for communication for parents.

**TABLE 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article/Study</th>
<th>Keywords/Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family Structural Openness</td>
<td>Child Adjustment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication (not racial/about adoption and family structure)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self-esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Development &amp; Initial Validation of Transracial Adoption</td>
<td>Cultural socialization practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Racial socialization practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Racial awareness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Racial Socialization Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A path analysis of cultural &amp; racial socialization</td>
<td>Cultural socialization practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In Racial Socialization in Transracial adoptive families: Does it help Adolescents</td>
<td>Racial Socialization Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;American&quot; or &quot;Multiethnic&quot; Family Ethnic Identity</td>
<td>Cultural Socialization Practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Identity Development in a Transracial Environment Minnesota</td>
<td>Self-esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Healthy Black Identity</td>
<td>Racial Identity (&quot;Black Identity&quot;)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being Raised by White People</td>
<td>Absence of Racial resemblance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercountry Transracial Adoption &amp; Ethnic Identity: Korean Example</td>
<td>Ethnic Identity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 2

Starts on next page.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Studies/Article</th>
<th>Publication (year)</th>
<th>Sample</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Findings</th>
<th>Limitations &amp; Future Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Intercountry transracial adoption and ethnic identity: A Korean Example | 2000 | - 40 Korean children adoptees
- ages 9 to 14
- 30 adoptive family households
- child welfare agency in north-eastern New York | - Separate **interviews** of children and parents & cross-check
- Interviews questions: narrating certain events relating to developmental processes connecting with the children ages followed with probing questions
- **Analysis uses Cross’s development of ethnic identity** (Huh & Reid, 2000) | - Ethnic identity to be positively correlated by participation in cultural activities and communication of adoption with parents and children
- if children were at lower stages of developmental of ethnic identity had harder time for adjustment
- lacked parent involvement in birth culture, and poorer communication with parent regarding discrimination
- value in helping adopted children to develop ethnic identities that incorporate their cultures of origin (Huh & Reid, 2000) | - Social workers should help facilitate parental involvement with their children in activities that will foster their childrens development of integrated ethnic identities
- increase teachers sensitivity to the needs of adoptees
- Diversity education might be encouraged (Huh & Reid, 2000) |
| Family Structural Openness and Communication Openness as Predictors in the Adjustment of Adopted Children | 2006 | - 73 children, ages 8 to 13, and their adopted parents.
- 75% domestic adoptions (85% inracial, 15% transracial)
- Â¼ of group were international adoptions (39% inracial, 61% transracial) | - Home based **interviews**, separated parents and adoptees
- **Family Structural Openness Inventory** (20-item, true-false, parent-report instrument)
- **Adoption Communication Openness Scale** (14-item, child-report instrument, adapted from the Parent-Adolescent Communication Scale & uses a 5-point Likert-type scale) (Brodzinsky, 2006)
- **Child Adjustment Measures** (child, self-report measure, the Self-)| - Correlation between international adoptees, which majority of them were transracial adoptees, less communication, and lower self-esteem (Brodzinsky, 2006)
- Communication openness positive correlation with the two child adjustment measures( higher self esteem and lower adjustment difficulties correlated with open communication) (Brodzinsky, 2006)
- Communication about adoption between parents and adoptees has positive correlations with child adjustment (Brodzinsky, 2006)
- first study to examine the relative contribution of family structural openness versus communication openness in relation to child outcome measures (Brodzinsky, 2006) | - Does not include communication on racial issues or discussion on race
- Majority of participants are not a transracial adoption
- Structural openness may be the reason
- Future suggestions: expand on the current findings (Brodzinsky, 2006) |
| Racial Socialization Practices of White Mothers of International Transracial Adoptees | 2008 | - 8 white international transracially adopted mothers | - Basic Qualitative design to understand phenomenon | - Determined 4 categories of cultural diversity exposure; *families like ours, visiting cultures, invested in culture, and diverse life* (Crolly-Simic & Vonk, 2008) | - Participant amount is very small (keeping in mind it is a qualitative study) | - Only accounts for Southeastern region of the U.S. | - If able to replicate study on a bigger scale to insure (Crolly-Simic & Vonk, 2008) |
| Being Raised by White People: Navigating Racial Difference Among Adopted Multiracial Adults | 2009 | - 25 transracially adoptees (black-white multiracial adoptees from the United States) | - interpretive study: experiences similarities and distinctions using adoption research and multiracial information to explore 3 aspects of their experience: the centrality yet absence of racial resemblance, navigating discordant parent-child racial experiences and managing societal perceptions of transracial adoption (Samuels, 2009) | - Identity affected adoptees felt distant due to the lack of physical trait resemblance with the family - Majority of adoptees stated their parents used and supported colorblindness which lead to lack of discussion of racism, race or ethnicity prior to the adoptee having a problem regarding them (Samuels, 2009) | This study recruited families who adopted from foster care: Future suggestions: family based longitudinal designs that represent greater class diversity, drawing on the perspectives of all family members involved in the adoptive experience over the life course (Samuels, 2009) | - usually closed adoptions | - Small sample | - Parents may now be more culturally aware, but may fail to implement culture |
| Racial Socialization in Transracial Adoptive Families: Does It Help Adolescents Deal With | 2013 | - White adoptive parents  
- racial or ethnic minority adoptee  
- between ages of 13 and 18  
- adopted home in the United States by age 3  
- data from a bigger | - online questionnaires  
- *hierarchical linear regression analysis*  
- The Schedule of Racist Events (frequency child-reported) 6 point Likert scale | supports the importance of transracial adoptive parents to engage their transracially adopted children in racial socialization practices to protect them from the negative effects of discrimination, specifically stress (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, & Riley, 2013) | - Small sample, additional research to confirm is needed  
- cultural socialization and preparation for bias are equally relevant in moderating the impact of discrimination based stress |

| A Healthy Black Identity” Transracial Adoption, Middle-Class Families, and Racial Socialization | 2011 | - Middle class 32 black adoptees  
- Adults from age 18 to 30  
- 3 groups: monoracial (13), biracial (10), and transracial (9)  
- snowball sampling (Butler-Sweet, 2011) | - comparison of experiences of in-depth *interviews* that are semi-structured  
- *a life history approach (chronological fashion)*: memory, perception, and inter black youth recalled growing up (Butler-Sweet, 2011)  
- *series of demographic, closed-ended questions* (Butler-Sweet, 2011)  
- open-ended questions where they were asked to talk about their public and private experiences throughout childhood and early adulthood (Butler-Sweet, 2011) | found all adoptees grew up with their adoptive parent emphasizing the importance of how to properly articulate themselves (Butler-Sweet, 2011)  
- found black adoptees with two black parents connected this with disproving stereotypes of blackness, as they relayed the message poverty doesn’t define blackness (Butler-Sweet, 2011)  
- The other two groups of black adoptees, tended to believe in racial stereotypes of African Americans; blacks having poor grammar and are lazy, unlike black adoptees with two black parents (Butler-Sweet, 2011) | - May have omissions due to selective memory of participants (Butler-Sweet, 2011)  
- Looking into class socialization and the impact of class on identity for black youth prior to changing adopting practice (Butler-Sweet, 2011) |
<p>| Identity Development in a Transracial Environment: Racial/Ethnic Minority Adoptees in Minnesota | 2015 | - Asian, Latino, black, and mixed/other transracial adoptees and same-race white adoptees (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, &amp; Iacono, 2015) | - secondary analysis from Sibling Interaction and Behavior Study (2007) - longitudinal study from three large adoption agencies (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, &amp; Iacono, 2015) | - discrepancy between parent and child reports regarding communication about race and ethnicity with black and mixed/other adoptees and their parents (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, &amp; Iacono, 2015) - Parents of the black and mixed/other adoptees reported higher levels of communication about race and ethnicity, while children reported lower levels of |
| Disciminination Stress? study about transracially adopted youth (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, &amp; Riley, 2013) | 2013 | • The Racial Socialization Scale (parent-reported frequency) (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, &amp; Riley, 2013) | and whether this might vary based on the age and race of the child (Leslie, Smith, Hrapczynski, &amp; Riley, 2013) | - larger samples of transracially adopted Black, mixed, and Latino adoptees (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, &amp; Iacono, 2015) - Future studies take into account for gender - ideal research design would include a control group of adoptees of color raised by same-race parents |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Development and Initial Validation of the Transracial Adoption Parenting Scale--Revised</th>
<th>First 2016</th>
<th>Revis ed 2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Families for Chinese Children, a parent support group throughout the U.S., with the requirements of parents adopting a child from child within the years 1994 to 2010 (Lee, Crolley-Simic, &amp; Vonk, 2016)</td>
<td>- cross sectional, online survey</td>
<td>- racial awareness and cultural socialization had high intercorrelation (Lee, Crolley-Simic, &amp; Vonk, 2016)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- 310 completed the survey</td>
<td>- 47-item TAPS-R</td>
<td>- supports past research about parent’s usage of racial awareness and cultural socialization practices with transracial and/or international adoptees and its effect on the adoptees’ own racial awareness and views of race and culture (Lee, Crolley-Simic, &amp; Vonk, 2016)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Exploration sibling communication (Hamilton, Samek, Keyes, McGue, & Iacono, 2015)

| - collect more research about the effects of parenting regarding racial awareness and culture socialization effects adoptees of transracial and international adoptees (Lee, Crolley-Simic, & Vonk, 2016) |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A path analysis of a cultural and racial socialization model in international transracial adoption: Racial awareness, self-efficacy, and socialization practices</th>
<th>2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- parents adopting children from other countries usually China</td>
<td>- path analysis (indirect and direct relationships among racial awareness, cultural and racial socialization self-efficacy, and cultural and racial socialization practices) (Lee, Vonk, Han, &amp; Jung, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- adoption occurred during 1994 and 2010</td>
<td>- clear need for education and support for White parents who adopt internationally across race about racial awareness and both types of socialization practices (Lee, Vonk, Han, &amp; Jung, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- children had to be ages 3 to 18 during survey</td>
<td>- found the factors of racial awareness, socialization self-efficacy, and socialization practices was related to communication and coping with racism and discrimination (indirectly or directly) (Lee, Vonk, Han, &amp; Jung, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convenience sample</td>
<td>- connects racial awareness to parents’ communication to their transracial adopted children about tough issues (Lee, Vonk, Han, &amp; Jung, 2018)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Lee, Vonk, Han, &amp; Jung, 2018)</td>
<td>- skewing the results toward parents who were already engaged in post-adoption support or who were more likely to engage in socialization practices (Lee, Vonk, Han, &amp; Jung, 2018)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- the findings to non-White parents of non-Asian children is limited (Lee, Vonk, Han, & Jung, 2018)

| - longitudinal study in future (Lee, Vonk, Han, & Jung, 2018) |

Methodology Key: Orange- Qualitative Â Blue- Quantitative Â Red- Interviews Â Purple- Survey Â Green- same data sample
CONCLUSION

All of the studies that focus on racial or cultural socialization had communication within the definition of either socialization practices. Racial, ethnicity, and cultural socialization practices seem to be an important aspect in transracial adoptions. Communication plays a huge role in racial and cultural socialization practices and studies found demonstrated benefits of socialization practices for adoptees relating to discrimination. The two studies about child adjustment and communication were inconclusive. The two racial awareness studies were minimal as well, but demonstrated benefits for adoptees to deal with discrimination as well. More research should examine racial awareness for a better understanding. Studies about adoptees identity and communication about race had mix and complex depending on other circumstances of the transracial adoptive family. More research with many different types of transracial adoptive family profiles should be examined to get a better understanding as results are inconclusive. Communication tended to not be the main factor studies were focusing on but were mentioned some way in each study. Parent’s role includes what they communicate with their adopted child and that communication can effect several factors with the adoptee. Transracial adoptions in particular have the additional challenges that same-race adoptions may not have.

Future studies should focus on transracial adoptees that are not international or conduct studies that compare the difference of the two in regard to communication of race issues and identity. Future studies should obtain a bigger sample size, as many interpretive studies include a small sample size and are harder to generalize. This will allow better education for transracial adoptee parents and professionals to create a better understanding of transracial adoptee and the effect parent’s role has in regard to communication.
References


https://www.childwelfare.gov/pubs/issue-briefs/racial-disproportionality/

